

MUSIC QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

Report

Follow-up procedure for the
Accreditation of Programmes delivered by the
Escola Superior de Música de Lisboa (ESML)



**ESCOLA SUPERIOR
DE MÚSICA DE LISBOA**

Contents

- Introduction 4
- Key data on ESML** 4
- 1. Conditions listed by the MusiQuE Review Team (in the 2017 procedure) 6
 - Condition 16
 - Condition 27
 - Conclusions8
- 2. Recommendations listed by the MusiQuE Review Team (in the 2017 procedure) 9
 - Standard 19
 - Standard 2.19
 - Standard 2.2 10
 - Standard 2.3 11
 - Standard 3.2 11
 - Standard 4.1 12
 - Standard 5.2 12
 - Standard 5.3 12
 - Standard 6.2 13
 - Standard 7 13
 - Standard 8.1 14
 - Standard 8.2 14
 - Standard 8.3 15
- 3. Recommendations listed by the MusiQuE Review Team (in the 2017 procedure) 16
 - Standard 1 16
 - Standard 2.1 16
 - Standard 2.2 17
 - Standard 2.3 18
 - Standard 3.1 19
 - Standard 3.2 19
 - Standard 4.1 19
 - Standard 5.2 20
 - Standard 5.3 20
 - Standard 6.2 21
 - Standard 7 21

Standard 8.1	22
Standard 8.2	22
Standard 8.3	22
4. Recommendations listed by the MusiQuE Review Team (in the 2017 procedure)	24
Standard 1	24
Standard 2.1	24
Standard 2.2	25
Standard 2.3	26
Standard 3.1	27
Standard 3.2	27
Standard 4.1	27
Standard 5.2	28
Standard 5.3	28
Standard 6.2	29
Standard 7	29
Standard 8.1	30
Standard 8.2	30
Standard 8.3	30

Introduction

The initial review concerned 3 programmes offered by ESML. The site visit took place on 11-13 December 2017. The Review Team report sent to the institution was presented to the MusiQuE Board on 18 April 2018 and, following further adjustments required by the Board, revised. The final report was sent to the institution on 18 June 2018.

The Bachelor in Music (BMus) and Master in Music (MMus) were both granted accreditation, but the Bachelor in Music Technologies (BMT) was granted conditional accreditation.

In order to gain accreditation for the Bachelor in Music Technologies, ESML was required to complete a follow-up template within 18 months to provide evidence that the conditions had been implemented. ESML completed the template with reports of the actions undertaken for each Condition and also selected recommendations in the original MusiQuE report.

The follow-up accreditation procedure thus followed the usual three-stage process:

1. ESML prepared a follow-up documentation to provide evidence that the Conditions had been implemented;
2. The evidence provided was analysed by Peter Tornquist, Rector of Norwegian Academy of Music and Chair of the original Review Team and Daan van Aalst, independent Recording Producer / Sound Engineer, teacher at the Art of Sound department of the Royal Conservatoire in The Hague also member of the Review Team that conducted the site-visit in 2017.
3. On the basis of comments by the two experts, the MusiQuE staff produced the report that follows, structured following the Conditions and recommendations against selected Standards.

Key data on ESML

Name of the institution	Escola Superior de Música de Lisboa (ESML)
Legal status	Public institution
Date of creation	1983
Website	https://www.esml.ipl.pt
Programmes offered	Bachelor in Music Bachelor in Music Technologies Bachelor of Music in the Community Master in Music Master in Music Teaching PhD in Musical Arts (in collaboration with the Universidade Nova de Lisboa)

	PhD in Performing Arts, Moving Image and Movement (in collaboration with the Universidade de Lisboa)
Number of students	<p>Numbers for academic year 2017-2018 for programmes considered in this report:</p> <p>Bachelor in Music: 346</p> <p>Bachelor in Music Technologies: 70</p> <p>Master in Music: 39</p>

1. Conditions listed by the MusiQuE Review Team (in the 2017 procedure)

Condition 1

Condition: The Review Team found that the BMT programme needs to adopt a more international perspective and keep up to date with international developments in the field, for example, through affiliation to the AES (Audio Engineering Society); it also needs to ensure that international opportunities are equally open to BMT students. Therefore this standard will only be met on condition that the programme affiliates itself to an appropriate international organisation and that BMT students are offered the same international opportunities as their peers on the BMus (In relation to Standard 2.2).

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML to meet the conditions and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML is now associated with the Portuguese Society of Acoustics, and through this society ESML is also linked to the European associations such as the European Acoustics Association, the International Commission for Acoustics, the International Institute of Acoustics and Vibration, the International Institute of Noise Control Engineering and the Federação Iberoamericana de Acústica. ESML is not eligible for affiliation to the AES (Audio Engineering Society, because this association does not accept institutional members, only individual ones.
- ESML is also associated to the SEAMUS - Society for Electro-Acoustic Music in the United States and ICMA - International Computer Music Association.
- In this academic year, ESML has a graduate student doing an internship at the Edge Recording Studio in Cheshire, Manchester, England under the Erasmus + program.

The reviewer acknowledges that ESML has taken steps to affiliate itself to relevant national and international organisations in the disciplines connected to the programme. We also acknowledge that the institution has initiated student exchanges within the framework of Erasmus+, thereby fulfilling the conditions related to standard 2.2. The reviewer recommends that the institution continues to facilitate the involvement of students in international activities by encouraging individual affiliation to organisations such as AES and by further development of exchange activities.

Condition 2

Condition: The space, equipment and software for the BMT is not adequate or wholly fit for purpose. The standard will only be met on the condition that additional funding for capital expenditure on equipment including but not limited to an additional digital mixing console and measurement devices and software (although open source software could be better utilized) is made available to avoid unacceptable contingency measures, such as staff using their own equipment, as observed by the Review Team. (In relation to Standard 5.1.)

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML to meet the conditions and analysis of the progress achieved:

- Since the beginning of 2018 ESML-IPL has made a significant investment in the BMT course, acquiring many reference sound equipment, such as microphones from Neumann, Schoeps, DPA, AGK, Sennheiser, Audio Techniques, Beyerdynamic, Sure and a microphone ambisonics, audio interfaces like RME, Focusrite, Pre Sonus, Tascan, Steinberg.
- ESML laboratories are now equipped with multimeters, oscilloscopes, function generators, power supplies, sound level meters, calibrators, measuring microphones and acoustic analysis software.
- Software such as Nuendo, Reaper, Wavelab were also purchased for the studios and a Mac Computer for the main studio.
- The large auditorium is now equipped with a PA with 8 Top, 2 subwoofers and 4 munition columns, a permanent wiring cable system and also a wireless microphone system.
- In addition to this recently acquired equipment, the ordering process is still underway for the purchase of more computers and editing and postproduction software for the studios and for the auditorium, as well as several reference digital mixers, from Midas, Yamaha and Soundcraft.

The reviewer acknowledges that the investments made by ESML regarding the technical and physical resources available to students of the BMT programme are in line with the expectations of the Review Team. Sufficient thought has been given to strengthening all parts of the music production chain, from input to processing and output. The investments made in software and equipment are fully specified in the additional documentation provided by the institution and reflect the standards of the profession. We find that the conditions set for compliance with Standard 5.1 have been met.

Conclusions

The reviewer has studied the information provided by the institution as part of the MusiQuE Follow-up Procedures regarding the conditions and recommendations set forward in the report from the original Review Team. We have received supplemental information detailing the exact number, manufacturer and model of every piece of equipment acquired as part of an ambitious investment plan. We acknowledge that these investments are in line with the expectations of the Review Team, and that careful thought has been given to strengthening all parts of the music production chain, from input to processing and output. We also find that clear steps have been taken towards strengthening the international dimensions of the programme, including formal affiliation to relevant organisations in the profession and granting students of the programme access to international exchange.

We find that the conditions set for compliance with MusiQuE Standards 2.2. and 5.1 have been met and recommend that the Bachelor in Music Technology Programme at ESML be accredited by the Board.

2. Recommendations listed by the MusiQuE Review Team (in the 2017 procedure)

Bachelor of Music

Standard 1: The programme goals are clearly stated and reflect the institutional mission.

Recommendations:

- The Review Team strongly recommends that the BMus programme produces a Programme Handbook (in both Portuguese and English) which is easily available on the website, clearly sets out the programme's goals in appropriate detail and explicitly links to the ESML institutional mission.
- ESML considers how it might benefit from a closer academic relationship with its parent institution, IPL, particularly exploring inter-disciplinary opportunities.
- ESML places itself in the forefront of political debates as an advocate for the arts and higher education artistic education.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- The BMus programme had an original Programme Handbook that was now subject to review and translation in English, and both Portuguese and English versions are available on the website, clearly stating the programme's goals in detail and explicitly related with the ESML institutional mission (<https://www.esml.ipl.pt/index.php/bachelor-in-music-handbook>).
- In the past four years, ESML academic relationship with its parent institution, IPL, and other IPL Organic Units has increased in cooperation and support, including shared projects and events' organization.
- ESML is trying to assume publicly its role as an advocate for the arts and higher artistic education. However, the dialogue with government and other political officials depends entirely on their awareness of the importance of this area.

The reviewer acknowledges that a comprehensive and updated Programme Handbook for the BMus programme has been published on the ESML website (in Portuguese and English), including all relevant information on the programme and clear links to the institutional mission. The relationship between ESML and its parent institution, IPL, seems to have been strengthened on the academic as well as the administrative level. The reviewer commends this development and recommend that it is monitored and further developed, particularly in relation to exploring inter-disciplinary opportunities.

Standard 2.1: The goals of the programme are achieved through the content and structure of the curriculum and its methods of delivery.

Recommendation:

- As for Standard 1, the Review Team strongly recommends that the BMus programme produces a

Programme Handbook (in both Portuguese and English) which is easily available on the website, clearly sets out the programme's goals in appropriate detail and explicitly links to the ESML institutional mission.

- e-Learning as a method of delivery could be developed in the BMus programme.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- The BMus programme had an original Programme Handbook that was now subject to review and translation in English, and both Portuguese and English versions are available on the website, clearly stating the programme's goals in detail and explicitly related with the ESML institutional mission (<https://www.esml.ipl.pt/index.php/bachelor-in-music-handbook>).
- Network tools are regularly used by teachers and students through different platforms, including Moodle

The reviewer acknowledges that a comprehensive and updated Programme Handbook is now available on the ESML website (in Portuguese and English), including all relevant information on the programme and clear links to the institutional mission.

There is no indication of new developments regarding the use of e-learning in the BMus programme, but the reviewer is confident that the necessary tools and systems are in place on order to allow this to be further developed at a later stage.

Standard 2.2: The programme offers a range of opportunities for students to gain an international perspective.

Recommendations:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML should create an international strategy, including targets for international recruitment, and a language policy for programme documentation and teaching.
- The Review Team recommends that ESML should be better supported financially in its internationalisation efforts as these are not at an appropriate level for an elite national institution.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML is developing an international strategy through the organization of high-level international academic meetings, and the increase of international masterclasses and international teachers' recruitment, as well as the increase of international partnerships and Erasmus+ mobility. The translated information in English is being progressively created.
- The budget constraints observed in the past eight years did not change. However, IPL has implemented a new platform for international students' application, and most actively supported all ESML organization endeavours of international events.

The reviewer welcomes the development of ESML's international activities through high-level academic meetings, international masterclasses, and increased awareness of international recruitment and exchange policies. This development is evident on the updated website. We also welcome the increased administrative support by IPL towards international applicants and international events.

Standard 2.3 Assessment methods are clearly defined and demonstrate achievement of learning outcomes.

Recommendations:

- ESML should increase clarity and transparency about the programme's assessment methods; rather than over-generalised statements, methods of assessment should be specifically aligned to learning outcomes.
- ESML should clarify the role of external examiners and invite external members of the profession to assessment panels.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML reviewed all of the BMus curricular units (CU) forms in order to link its assessment methods with the respective learning outcomes, preserving the consistency and coherence of principles in every CU and, at the same time, allowing for some flexibility on the adoption of specific calculations in order to produce a classification (<https://www.esml.ipl.pt/index.php/curricular-units>). Of course, every teacher, in the beginning of each semester, informs all the students about these specific assessment calculation details.
- Whenever convenient and adequate, ESML invites other external members of the profession to assessment panels. However, these invitations are always gracious for there is no budget available.

The assessment methods for each unit of the programme are available on the ESML website and appear to be up to date, transparent and relevant to learning outcomes. The use of external examiners and involvement of external members of the profession could be further explored but is clearly also a question of financial priorities. The reviewer recommends that this external input should be given priority whenever the budgetary situation allows.

Standard 3.2: The programme has mechanisms to formally monitor and review the progression, achievement and subsequent employability of its students

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML uses data from the QA reports more strategically.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- A new data platform was implemented that is helping to make QA reports more reliable. This is a process in permanent development.

The reviewer welcomes the effort being made towards making QA reports more relevant and reliable.

Standard 4.1: Members of the teaching staff are qualified for their role and are active as artists/pedagogues/researchers.

Recommendation:

- The ESML should consider a strategy for continuing professional development of its staff and should apply for funding to IPL to implement it.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML teaching staff academic qualifications have increased significantly in the past 4 years. Funding from IPL is implemented but limited to budget constraints.

The reviewer acknowledges the positive development of teaching staff qualifications, as evidenced by continuously updated list of projects and publications on the website (Repositório Científico da IPL and CESEM).

Standard 5.2: The institution's financial resources enable successful delivery of the study programmes.

Recommendation:

The Review Team recommends that ESML takes steps to diversify its funding streams and produces a financial strategy which takes account of this.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

This issue is in permanent consideration, and every opportunity to find external funding to our activities is taken. In the present, some of our research activities are funded by the Science and Technology Foundation (FCT). In this environment, continuous funding streams for the Arts and Education are simply non-existent. No kind of tradition of cultural or education sponsorship is available, and cultural industries struggle to exist.

The reviewer acknowledges the efforts being made by the institution to diversify its funding streams in relation to research activities.

Standard 5.3. The programme has sufficient qualified support staff.

Recommendation:

The Review Team strongly recommends that academic staff are not required to undertake support roles and that the ESML management team and IPL should take steps to rectify this. Paying students to undertake tasks such as being on duty in the Library may be one small solution; devolving more core support to central IPL services, and/or

properly funding and professionalizing support roles (Registry roles, Erasmus administration, web and email support) is an urgent priority.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

Recently, ESML has hired some new support staff. The support roles are undertaken by ESML non-academic staff. Its supervision however is coordinated by teachers. Some other tasks are also undertaken by students funded by scholarships.

The reviewer welcomes the addition of new support staff and encourage the institution to further develop and professionalize the non-academic support roles at the institution.

Standard 6.2: The programme is supported by an appropriate organisational structure and decision- making processes.

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that the decision-making process of ESML could be made more transparent.
- The Review Team recommends that staff roles and responsibilities should be more clearly defined; further, that individuals should not undertake more than one main role. As well as overloading that individual it can compromise innovation and debate and could, at worst, at lead to conflict of interest.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML decision making process is always improving in transparency, and all its organizational structure is in place and fulfilling their role with all respect for democratic and transparency rules.
- ESML statutes were revised, and all structures, staff roles and responsibilities are very clearly defined; The risks associated with individual superposition of roles are very clear to everyone at ESML, and all the necessary steps are taken to avoid any kind of disfunction or irregularity.

The revised ESML statutes reflect changes to the decision process aimed at clarifying roles and responsibilities and increasing transparency in decision-making.

Standard 7: The programme has in place effective quality assurance and enhancement procedures.

Recommendation:

- ESML is substantially compliant with this standard: it has an informal QA culture as well as all the formal mechanisms in place, yet the informal and the formal IPL QA system are not quite integrated. The Review Team recommends that ESML continues to develop its QA and enhancement procedures in partnership

with IPL and makes efforts to act upon feedback from surveys after they become mandatory. It also notes that this area of QA is professional and is ideally carried out by specialist academic managers (often in other conservatoires in Registry or Academic Services departments). There are possibilities of working in partnership with IPL's other arts schools on this.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML, in close cooperation with IPL, is improving the QA procedures and system which was revised and is about to be implemented.

The reviewer welcomes the continued development of QA procedures, and commend that these are being made in cooperation with IPL.

Standard 8.1. The programme engages within wider cultural, artistic and educational contexts

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML should be generally more proactive and outward facing. It has an obvious role as an advocate of the arts of the Portuguese cultural sector.
- The Review Team recommends there is much to be gained by greater engagement with ESML's local IPL context in extending its reach and entrepreneurial spirit.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML takes its role as an advocate of the arts of the Portuguese cultural sector as far and as proactively as it is possible, both institutionally and informally. In our political environment, results are very hard to achieve if the government officials neglect their role and avoid all kind of productive and effective dialogue with the representative institutions.
- Each year, ESML artistic and scientific national and international activities are increasing in numbers and visibility through the media.

The reviewer acknowledges the efforts made by the institution towards strengthening its role as an advocate of the arts in the cultural sector, and towards increasing the reach of its activities.

Standard 8.2: The programme actively promotes links with various sectors of the music and other artistic professions

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that employers could be invited to take part in ESML's curricular development to ensure formally that the curriculum continues to reflect professional requirements.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- Predominantly, our teaching staff is engaged in the professional world (some as employer's officials), so all curricular development is oriented to ensure formally that the curriculum continues to reflect professional requirements.

The high level of professional engagement by ESML faculty is a valuable asset in the on-going pursuit of a curriculum that reflects the changing realities of the profession.

Standard 8.3: Information provided to the public about the programme is clear, consistent and accurate.

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that as part a policy and rolling programme for updating and monitoring currency of content on the website, that all web content is available in English.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- This goal is definitely pursued by ESML, and some work has been and will be progressively done.

The reviewer welcomes the gradual improvements made to the website since the December 2017 site-visit and acknowledges that a larger part of the content now is available in English.

3. Recommendations listed by the MusiQuE Review Team (in the 2017 procedure)

Bachelor in Music Technologies

Standard 1: The programme goals are clearly stated and reflect the institutional mission.

Recommendations:

- The Review Team strongly recommends that the BMT programme produces a Programme Handbook (in both Portuguese and English) which is easily available on the website, clearly sets out the programme's goals in appropriate detail and explicitly links to the ESML institutional mission.
- ESML considers how it might benefit from a closer academic relationship with its parent institution, IPL, particularly exploring inter-disciplinary opportunities.
- ESML places itself in the forefront of political debates as an advocate for the arts and higher education artistic education.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- The BMT programme had an original Programme Handbook that was now subject to review and translation in English, and both Portuguese and English versions are available on the website, clearly stating the programme's goals in detail and explicitly related with the ESML institutional mission (<https://www.esml.ipl.pt/index.php/bachelor-in-music-technologies-handbook>).
- In the past four years, ESML academic relationship with its parent institution, IPL, and other IPL Organic Units has increased in cooperation and support, including shared projects and events' organization.
- ESML is trying to assume publicly its role as an advocate for the arts and higher artistic education. However, the dialogue with government and other political officials depends entirely on their awareness of the importance of this area.

The reviewer acknowledges that a comprehensive and updated Programme Handbook for the BMT has been published on the ESML website (in Portuguese and English), including all relevant information on the programme and clear links to the institutional mission. The relationship between ESML and its parent institution, IPL, seems to have been strengthened on the academic as well as the administrative level. The reviewer commends this development and recommend that it is monitored and further developed, particularly in relation to exploring inter-disciplinary opportunities.

Standard 2.1: The goals of the programme are achieved through the content and structure of the curriculum and its methods of delivery.

Recommendation:

- As for Standard 1, the Review Team strongly recommends that the BMT programme produces a Programme Handbook (in both Portuguese and English) which is easily available on the website, clearly sets out the programme's goals in appropriate detail and explicitly links to the ESML institutional mission.
- e-Learning as a method of delivery could be developed in the BMT programme.
- The BMus and MT are academically and administratively separated; there would be advantages to some shared provision for BMT and BMus students, not least to encourage a spirit of true collaboration rather than the current 'service' relationship. For example, it could be a shared goal between BMT and performance departments to make doing a sound check an educational process for both 'sides'; also the processes of editing and mixing involve artistic concepts which would be fruitfully shared.
- The implicit research content of the BMT programme could be made explicit and reflected in programme documentation.
- In due course, a Masters in Music Technology would be a valuable addition to the ESML portfolio.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- The BMT programme had an original Programme Handbook that was now subject to review and translation in English, and both Portuguese and English versions are available on the website, clearly stating the programme's goals in detail and explicitly related with the ESML institutional mission (<https://www.esml.ipl.pt/index.php/bachelor-in-music-technologies-handbook>).
- Network tools are regularly used by teachers and students through different platforms, namely Moodle.
- The referred "service" relationship between BMus and BMT was subject to changes and will have more staff support so that the necessary spirit of true collaboration will prevail.
- The implicit research content of the BMT programme will be more explicitly reflected in programme documentation with the help of new teaching staff

The reviewer acknowledges that a comprehensive and updated Programme Handbook for the BMT programme is now available on the ESML website (in Portuguese and English), including all relevant information on the programme and clear links to the institutional mission.

There is no indication of new developments regarding the use of e-learning in the BMT programme, but the reviewers are confident that the necessary tools and systems are in place on order to allow this to be further developed at a later stage.

The reviewer welcomes the strengthening of the academic links between BMT and BMus programmes, and the clearer articulation of implicit research content in the revised BMT programme documentation.

Standard 2.2: The programme offers a range of opportunities for students to gain an international perspective.

Recommendations:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML should create an international strategy, including targets for

international recruitment, and a language policy for programme documentation and teaching.

- The Review Team recommends that ESML should be better supported financially in its internationalization efforts as these are not at an appropriate level for an elite national institution.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML is developing an international strategy through the organization of high-level international academic meetings, and the increase of international masterclasses and international teachers' recruitment, as well as the increase of international partnerships and Erasmus+ mobility. The translated information in English is being progressively created.
- The budget constraints observed in the past eight years did not change. However, IPL has implemented a new platform for international students' application, and most actively supported all ESML organization endeavours of international events.

The reviewer welcomes the development of ESML's international activities through high-level academic meetings, international masterclasses, and increased awareness of international recruitment and exchange policies. This development is evident on the updated website. We also welcome the increased administrative support by IPL towards international applicants and international events.

Standard 2.3 Assessment methods are clearly defined and demonstrate achievement of learning outcomes.

Recommendations:

- ESML should increase clarity and transparency about the programme's assessment methods; rather than over-generalised statements, methods of assessment should be specifically aligned to learning outcomes.
- ESML should clarify the role of external examiners and invite external members of the profession to assessment panels.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML reviewed all of the BMT curricular units (CU) resumés in order to link its assessment methods with the respective learning outcomes, preserving the consistency and coherence of principles in every CU and, at the same time, allowing for some flexibility on the adoption of specific calculations in order to produce a classification (<https://www.esml.ipl.pt/index.php/curricular-units>). Of course, every teacher, in the beginning of each semester, informs all the students about these specific assessment calculation details.

- Whenever convenient and adequate, ESML invites other external members of the profession to assessment panels. However, these invitations are always gracious for there is no budget available.

The assessment methods for each unit of the programme are available on the ESML website and appear to be up to date, transparent and relevant to learning outcomes. The use of external examiners and involvement of external members of the profession could be further explored but is clearly also a question of financial priorities. The reviewer recommends that this external input should be given priority whenever the budgetary situation allows.

Standard 3.1: There are clear criteria for student admission, based on an assessment of their artistic/academic suitability for the programme.

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that criteria for student admission should be available in English.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

This recommendation will be met in all programmes next year.

The reviewer looks forward to the implementation of this recommendation.

Standard 3.2: The programme has mechanisms to formally monitor and review the progression, achievement and subsequent employability of its students

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML uses data from the QA reports more strategically.
- The Review Team recommends that, particularly as it is relatively new, that more scrutiny is given to the BMT programme in the area of progression, achievement and employability.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

A new data platform was implemented that is helping to make QA reports more reliable. This is a process in permanent development.

The reviewer welcomes the effort being made towards making QA reports more relevant and reliable and recommends that special attention be given to following up findings connected to the BMT programme.

Standard 4.1. Members of the teaching staff are qualified for their role and are active as artists/pedagogues/researchers

Recommendation:

- ESML should consider a strategy for continuing professional development of its staff and should apply for funding to IPL to implement it.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

ESML teaching staff academic qualifications have increased significantly in the past 4 years, and in more expressive numbers in 2018. Funding from IPL is implemented but limited to budget constraints.

The reviewers acknowledge the positive development of teaching staff qualifications, as evidenced by continuously updated list of projects and publications on the website (Repositório Científico da IPL and CESEM).

Standard 5.2. The intuitions' financial resources enable successful delivery of the programme

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML takes steps to diversify its funding streams and produces a financial strategy which takes account of this.
- The Review Team recommends that the BMT programme explores opportunities for commercial sponsorship to assist in funding its equipment and software shortages.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

This issue is in permanent consideration, and every opportunity to find external funding to our activities is taken. In the present, some of our research activities are funded by the Science and Technology Foundation (FCT). In this environment, continuous funding streams for the Arts and Education are simply non-existent. No kind of tradition of cultural or education sponsorship is available, and cultural industries struggle to exist.

The reviewers acknowledge the efforts being made by the institution to diversify its funding streams in relation to research activities, and in particular the successful increase of capital expenditure related to the resources of the BMT Programme

Standard 5.3. The programme has sufficient qualified support staff

Recommendation:

- The Review Team strongly recommends that academic staff are not required to undertake support roles and that the ESML management team and IPL should take steps to rectify this. Paying students to undertake tasks such as being on duty in the Library may be one small solution; devolving more core support to central IPL services, and/or properly funding and professionalizing support roles (Registry roles, Erasmus administration, web and email support) is an urgent priority.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

This support roles are undertaken by ESML non-academic staff. Its supervision however is coordinated by

teachers. Some other tasks are also undertaken by students funded by scholarships.

The reviewers welcome the addition of new support staff and encourage the institution to further develop and professionalize the non-academic support roles at the institution.

Standard 6.2. The programme is supported by an appropriate organisational structure and decision- making processes

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that the decision making process of ESML could be made more transparent.
- The Review Team recommends that staff roles and responsibilities should be more clearly defined; further, that individuals should not undertake more than one main role. As well as overloading that individual it can compromise innovation and debate and could, at worst, atlead to conflict of interest.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

ESML decision making process is always improving in transparency, and all its organizational structure is in place and fulfilling their role with all respect for democratic and transparency rules.

ESML statutes were revised, and all structures, staff roles and responsibilities are very clearly defined; The risks associated to individual superposition of roles are very clear to everyone at ESML, and all the necessary steps are taken to avoid any kind of disfunction or irregularity.

The revised ESML statutes reflect changes to the decision process aimed at clarifying roles and responsibilities, and increasing transparency in decision-making.

Standard 7. The programme has in place effective quality assurance and enhancement procedure

Recommendation:

- ESML is substantially compliant with this standard: it has an informal QA culture as well as all the formal mechanisms in place, yet the informal and the formal IPL QA system are not quite integrated. The Review Team recommends that ESML continues to develop its QA and enhancement procedures in partnership with IPL, and makes efforts to act upon feedback from surveys after they become mandatory. It also notes that this area of QA is professional, and is ideally carried out by specialist academic managers (often in other conservatoires in Registry or Academic Services departments). There are possibilities of working in partnership with IPL's other specialist arts schools on this.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

ESML, in close cooperation with IPL, is improving the QA procedures and system which was revised and renewed and is about to be implemented.

The reviewers welcome the continued development of QA procedures, and commend that these are being

made in cooperation with IPL.

Standard 8.1. The programme engages within wider cultural, artistic, and educational contexts.

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML should be generally more proactive and outward facing. It has an obvious role as an advocate of the arts of the Portuguese cultural sector.
- The Review Team recommends there is much to be gained by greater engagement with ESML's local IPL context in extending its reach and entrepreneurial spirit.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

ESML takes its role as an advocate of the arts of the Portuguese cultural sector as far and as proactively as it is possible, both institutionally and informally. In our political environment, results are very hard to achieve if the government officials neglect their role and avoid all kind of productive and effective dialogue with the representative institutions.

Each year, ESML artistic and scientific national and international activities are increasing in numbers and visibility through the media.

The reviewers acknowledge the efforts made by the institution towards strengthening its role as an advocate of the arts in the cultural sector, and towards increasing the reach of its activities.

Standard 8.2. The programme actively promotes links with various sectors of the music and other artistic professions

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that employers could be invited to take part in ESML's curricular development to ensure formally that the curriculum continues to reflect professional requirement.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

Predominantly, our teaching staff is engaged in the professional world (some as employer's officials), so all curricular development is oriented to ensure formally that the curriculum continues to reflect professional requirements.

The high level of professional engagement by ESML faculty is a valuable asset in the on-going pursuit of a curriculum that reflects the changing realities of the profession.

Standard 8.3. Information provided to the public about the programme is clear, consistent and accurate

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that as part a policy and rolling programme for updating and monitoring currency of content on the website, that all web content is available in English.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

This goal is, definitely, pursued by ESML, and some work has been done and will be progressively done.

The reviewers welcome the gradual improvements made to the website since the December 2017 site-visit, and acknowledge that a larger part of the content now is available in English.

4. Recommendations listed by the MusiQuE Review Team (in the 2017 procedure)

Master in Music

Standard 1: The programme goals are clearly stated and reflect the institutional mission.

Recommendations:

- The Review Team strongly recommends that the BMT programme produces a Programme Handbook (in both Portuguese and English) which is easily available on the website, clearly sets out the programme's goals in appropriate detail and explicitly links to the ESML institutional mission.
- ESML considers how it might benefit from a closer academic relationship with its parent institution, IPL, particularly exploring inter-disciplinary opportunities.
- ESML places itself in the forefront of political debates as an advocate for the arts and higher education artistic education.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- The BMT programme had an original Programme Handbook that was now subject to review and translation in English, and both Portuguese and English versions are available on the website, clearly stating the programme's goals in detail and explicitly related with the ESML institutional mission (<https://www.esml.ipl.pt/index.php/bachelor-in-music-technologies-handbook>).
- In the past four years, ESML academic relationship with its parent institution, IPL, and other IPL Organic Units has increased in cooperation and support, including shared projects and events' organization.
- ESML is trying to assume publicly its role as an advocate for the arts and higher artistic education. However, the dialogue with government and other political officials depends entirely on their awareness of the importance of this area.

The reviewer acknowledges that a comprehensive and updated Programme Handbook for the BMT has been published on the ESML website (in Portuguese and English), including all relevant information on the programme and clear links to the institutional mission. The relationship between ESML and its parent institution, IPL, seems to have been strengthened on the academic as well as the administrative level. The reviewer commends this development and recommend that it is monitored and further developed, particularly in relation to exploring inter-disciplinary opportunities.

Standard 2.1: The goals of the programme are achieved through the content and structure of the curriculum and its methods of delivery.

Recommendation:

- As for Standard 1, the Review Team strongly recommends that the BMT programme produces a Programme Handbook (in both Portuguese and English) which is easily available on the website, clearly sets out the programme's goals in appropriate detail and explicitly links to the ESML institutional mission.
- e-Learning as a method of delivery could be developed in the BMT programme.
- The BMus and MT are academically and administratively separated; there would be advantages to some shared provision for BMT and BMus students, not least to encourage a spirit of true collaboration rather than the current 'service' relationship. For example, it could be a shared goal between BMT and performance departments to make doing a sound check an educational process for both 'sides'; also the processes of editing and mixing involve artistic concepts which would be fruitfully shared.
- The implicit research content of the BMT programme could be made explicit and reflected in programme documentation.
- In due course, a Masters in Music Technology would be a valuable addition to the ESML portfolio.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- The BMT programme had an original Programme Handbook that was now subject to review and translation in English, and both Portuguese and English versions are available on the website, clearly stating the programme's goals in detail and explicitly related with the ESML institutional mission (<https://www.esml.ipl.pt/index.php/bachelor-in-music-technologies-handbook>).
- Network tools are regularly used by teachers and students through different platforms, namely Moodle.
- The referred "service" relationship between BMus and BMT was subject to changes and will have more staff support so that the necessary spirit of true collaboration will prevail.
- The implicit research content of the BMT programme will be more explicitly reflected in programme documentation with the help of new teaching staff

The reviewer acknowledges that a comprehensive and updated Programme Handbook for the BMT programme is now available on the ESML website (in Portuguese and English), including all relevant information on the programme and clear links to the institutional mission.

There is no indication of new developments regarding the use of e-learning in the BMT programme, but the reviewers are confident that the necessary tools and systems are in place in order to allow this to be further developed at a later stage.

The reviewer welcomes the strengthening of the academic links between BMT and BMus programmes, and the clearer articulation of implicit research content in the revised BMT programme documentation.

Standard 2.2: The programme offers a range of opportunities for students to gain an international perspective.

Recommendations:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML should create an international strategy, including targets for

international recruitment, and a language policy for programme documentation and teaching.

- The Review Team recommends that ESML should be better supported financially in its internationalization efforts as these are not at an appropriate level for an elite national institution.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML is developing an international strategy through the organization of high-level international academic meetings, and the increase of international masterclasses and international teachers' recruitment, as well as the increase of international partnerships and Erasmus+ mobility. The translated information in English is being progressively created.
- The budget constraints observed in the past eight years did not change. However, IPL has implemented a new platform for international students' application, and most actively supported all ESML organization endeavours of international events.

The reviewer welcomes the development of ESML's international activities through high-level academic meetings, international masterclasses, and increased awareness of international recruitment and exchange policies. This development is evident on the updated website. We also welcome the increased administrative support by IPL towards international applicants and international events.

Standard 2.3 Assessment methods are clearly defined and demonstrate achievement of learning outcomes.

Recommendations:

- ESML should increase clarity and transparency about the programme's assessment methods; rather than over-generalised statements, methods of assessment should be specifically aligned to learning outcomes.
- ESML should clarify the role of external examiners and invite external members of the profession to assessment panels.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

- ESML reviewed all of the BMT curricular units (CU) resumés in order to link its assessment methods with the respective learning outcomes, preserving the consistency and coherence of principles in every CU and, at the same time, allowing for some flexibility on the adoption of specific calculations in order to produce a classification (<https://www.esml.ipl.pt/index.php/curricular-units>). Of course, every teacher, in the beginning of each semester, informs all the students about these specific assessment calculation details.

- Whenever convenient and adequate, ESML invites other external members of the profession to assessment panels. However, these invitations are always gracious for there is no budget available.

The assessment methods for each unit of the programme are available on the ESML website and appear to be up to date, transparent and relevant to learning outcomes. The use of external examiners and involvement of external members of the profession could be further explored but is clearly also a question of financial priorities. The reviewer recommends that this external input should be given priority whenever the budgetary situation allows.

Standard 3.1: There are clear criteria for student admission, based on an assessment of their artistic/academic suitability for the programme.

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that criteria for student admission should be available in English.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

This recommendation will be met in all programmes next year.

The reviewer looks forward to the implementation of this recommendation.

Standard 3.2: The programme has mechanisms to formally monitor and review the progression, achievement and subsequent employability of its students

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML uses data from the QA reports more strategically.
- The Review Team recommends that, particularly as it is relatively new, that more scrutiny is given to the BMT programme in the area of progression, achievement and employability.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

A new data platform was implemented that is helping to make QA reports more reliable. This is a process in permanent development.

The reviewer welcomes the effort being made towards making QA reports more relevant and reliable and recommends that special attention be given to following up findings connected to the BMT programme.

Standard 4.1. Members of the teaching staff are qualified for their role and are active as artists/pedagogues/researchers

Recommendation:

- ESML should consider a strategy for continuing professional development of its staff and should apply for funding to IPL to implement it.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

ESML teaching staff academic qualifications have increased significantly in the past 4 years, and in more expressive numbers in 2018. Funding from IPL is implemented but limited to budget constraints.

The reviewers acknowledge the positive development of teaching staff qualifications, as evidenced by continuously updated list of projects and publications on the website (Repositório Científico da IPL and CESEM).

Standard 5.2. The intuitions' financial resources enable successful delivery of the programme

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML takes steps to diversify its funding streams and produces a financial strategy which takes account of this.
- The Review Team recommends that the BMT programme explores opportunities for commercial sponsorship to assist in funding its equipment and software shortages.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

This issue is in permanent consideration, and every opportunity to find external funding to our activities is taken. In the present, some of our research activities are funded by the Science and Technology Foundation (FCT). In this environment, continuous funding streams for the Arts and Education are simply non-existent. No kind of tradition of cultural or education sponsorship is available, and cultural industries struggle to exist.

The reviewers acknowledge the efforts being made by the institution to diversify its funding streams in relation to research activities, and in particular the successful increase of capital expenditure related to the resources of the BMT Programme

Standard 5.3. The programme has sufficient qualified support staff

Recommendation:

- The Review Team strongly recommends that academic staff are not required to undertake support roles and that the ESML management team and IPL should take steps to rectify this. Paying students to undertake tasks such as being on duty in the Library may be one small solution; devolving more core support to central IPL services, and/or properly funding and professionalizing support roles (Registry roles, Erasmus administration, web and email support) is an urgent priority.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

This support roles are undertaken by ESML non-academic staff. Its supervision however is coordinated by

teachers. Some other tasks are also undertaken by students funded by scholarships.

The reviewers welcome the addition of new support staff and encourage the institution to further develop and professionalize the non-academic support roles at the institution.

Standard 6.2. The programme is supported by an appropriate organisational structure and decision- making processes

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that the decision making process of ESML could be made more transparent.
- The Review Team recommends that staff roles and responsibilities should be more clearly defined; further, that individuals should not undertake more than one main role. As well as overloading that individual it can compromise innovation and debate and could, at worst, atlead to conflict of interest.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

ESML decision making process is always improving in transparency, and all its organizational structure is in place and fulfilling their role with all respect for democratic and transparency rules.

ESML statutes were revised, and all structures, staff roles and responsibilities are very clearly defined; The risks associated to individual superposition of roles are very clear to everyone at ESML, and all the necessary steps are taken to avoid any kind of disfunction or irregularity.

The revised ESML statutes reflect changes to the decision process aimed at clarifying roles and responsibilities, and increasing transparency in decision-making.

Standard 7. The programme has in place effective quality assurance and enhancement procedure

Recommendation:

- ESML is substantially compliant with this standard: it has an informal QA culture as well as all the formal mechanisms in place, yet the informal and the formal IPL QA system are not quite integrated. The Review Team recommends that ESML continues to develop its QA and enhancement procedures in partnership with IPL, and makes efforts to act upon feedback from surveys after they become mandatory. It also notes that this area of QA is professional, and is ideally carried out by specialist academic managers (often in other conservatoires in Registry or Academic Services departments). There are possibilities of working in partnership with IPL's other specialist arts schools on this.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

ESML, in close cooperation with IPL, is improving the QA procedures and system which was revised and renewed and is about to be implemented.

The reviewers welcome the continued development of QA procedures, and commend that these are being

made in cooperation with IPL.

Standard 8.1. The programme engages within wider cultural, artistic, and educational contexts.

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that ESML should be generally more proactive and outward facing. It has an obvious role as an advocate of the arts of the Portuguese cultural sector.
- The Review Team recommends there is much to be gained by greater engagement with ESML's local IPL context in extending its reach and entrepreneurial spirit.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

ESML takes its role as an advocate of the arts of the Portuguese cultural sector as far and as proactively as it is possible, both institutionally and informally. In our political environment, results are very hard to achieve if the government officials neglect their role and avoid all kind of productive and effective dialogue with the representative institutions.

Each year, ESML artistic and scientific national and international activities are increasing in numbers and visibility through the media.

The reviewers acknowledge the efforts made by the institution towards strengthening its role as an advocate of the arts in the cultural sector, and towards increasing the reach of its activities.

Standard 8.2. The programme actively promotes links with various sectors of the music and other artistic professions

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that employers could be invited to take part in ESML's curricular development to ensure formally that the curriculum continues to reflect professional requirement.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

Predominantly, our teaching staff is engaged in the professional world (some as employer's officials), so all curricular development is oriented to ensure formally that the curriculum continues to reflect professional requirements.

The high level of professional engagement by ESML faculty is a valuable asset in the on-going pursuit of a curriculum that reflects the changing realities of the profession.

Standard 8.3. Information provided to the public about the programme is clear, consistent and accurate

Recommendation:

- The Review Team recommends that as part a policy and rolling programme for updating and monitoring currency of content on the website, that all web content is available in English.

Description of the actions undertaken by ESML and analysis of the progress achieved:

This goal is, definitely, pursued by ESML, and some work has been done and will be progressively done.

The reviewers welcome the gradual improvements made to the website since the December 2017 site-visit, and acknowledge that a larger part of the content now is available in English.